Transporting Jordanian Women into Employment

Policy Paper on National Issues from a Gender Perspective for USAID Takamol

December 2018
**Policy Paper Title:** Transporting Women into Employment: Challenges and Opportunities in the Jordanian Transportation Sector

**Funding and Support from:** United States Agency for International Development (USAID)

**Written by:**
- Mira Abu Moghli, Gender Equality Officer, WE LEAD, Jordan
- Émilie MacIsaac, Gender Equality and Empowerment Advisor, WE LEAD, Jordan
- Emily Wiseman, Gender Equality and Empowerment Advisor, WUSC, Canada

**Main Purpose:** Provide recommendations for the Jordanian transportation sector in creating and implementing inclusive policies using a uniquely gendered perspective.

**Country Office**
WUSC-Jordan Office in Amman

**Project Objectives**
- Increase women’s empowerment for sustainable economic growth through increased labour force participation.
- Working with local actors to provide safe and affordable transportation for young women is among its priorities.

**Support from Global Affairs Canada (GAC) in:**
Supporting disadvantaged individuals — particularly women and youth — in breaking down barriers to access education and employment and to empower them to shape the sustainable development of their societies.

**Target Areas:** East Amman, Irbid, Salt.

**Project Duration**
4 years (2017-2021)
## Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>About WE LEAD</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Issue</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methodology</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Impact of this Problem from a Gender Perspective</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reasons to Address the Problem: Key Barriers to Women’s Access to Transportation</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Higher Financial Burden</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greater Safety Concerns</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restrictions of Social Expectations and Gender Norms</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annexes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Purpose of Individuals’ Use of Transportation</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. The Key Players in Jordan’s Transportation Sector</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
About WE LEAD

The Women’s Economic Linkages and Employment Development (WE LEAD) Project aims to increase Jordanian women’s empowerment for sustainable economic growth through increased labour force participation. One way in which it is doing so is by working with local actors to improve women’s access to safe and affordable transportation services. Led by World University Service of Canada (WUSC) and the Canadian Leaders in International Consulting (CLIC), the project is funded by Global Affairs Canada. This policy paper received support from the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) to provide a gendered perspective to Jordan’s current transportation systems and plans. The goal is to support the development of a transportation sector that is more inclusive to all Jordanians.

The Issue

Improving women’s economic participation has been the focus of various programs in Jordan, may they focus on skills training, income generating activities or policy creation. And they have all come across one common issue: transportation. Characterized by relatively high costs, safety concerns, unreliability, and time consumption, transportation issues are often cited as the sole reason behind a worker leaving their job or not attending a training program. This, in an environment where only 14% of women are either employed or looking for employment. In the current economic conditions, women are being increasingly encouraged to enter the labour market to contribute to the family income. Yet, 40% of Jordanian women who are offered employment opportunities must turn these offers down solely due to transportation issues.

Looking at the transportation sector from a gender perspective, it is possible to identify ways in which men and women may experience transportation services differently. For women in particular, the costs associated with the use of transportation services disproportionately adds to the opportunity cost of being employed. For example, a 2014 study found that the average share of salary spent by all workers, both male and female, on transportation was 23%. Yet women spend, on average, 30% of their wages on transportation. Women are likely to spend proportionally even more than men on transportation since, on average, they earn smaller wages than men. This does not include the added costs fuelled by

---

5 WE LEAD Transportation Sector Assessment (2018)
gendered expectations\(^8\), such as taking children to daycare and caring for the home\(^9\). Furthermore, the safety concerns associated with using public transit significantly contribute to women refusing employment\(^10\). Notably, 30% of parents in Jordan refused to allow their children, in particular daughters, to take public transit for fear of harassment\(^11\). This concern for women’s safety, combined with societal perceptions of women in public spaces\(^12\), play an important role in women’s decisions, or those of their family members, to avoid using transportation services.

Jordan Vision 2025\(^13\) and Jordan’s Economic Growth Plan\(^14\) acknowledge the significant spillover effects that improved transportation options and increased female labour participation would have on the economy, yet transportation and gender remain treated as separate policy issues\(^15\). Furthermore, very little attention has been given in policy-making and planning to better adapt the transportation system to the different realities experienced by various groups of actual and potential passengers. This paper will fill that void by demonstrating that the intersection of poor public transportation services and limited private options when combined with financial barriers, safety concerns and gendered social norms and expectations, represents a major obstacle to women’s economic empowerment. Through an analysis of the financial, safety and social concerns, this paper will demonstrate that applying a gender perspective to the transportation sector is necessary for the development of an effective and inclusive transportation sector. It will be shown that applying a gender perspective in collecting data, creating policies, drafting plans and implementing new services is likely to help increase women’s use of transportation services and thus, improve their mobility. In turn, it is a way to diminish a significant barrier to other governmental goals, namely women’s contributions to the labour market. Based on this analysis, this paper offers recommendations to mend specific barriers that negatively influence women’s use of public and private transportation in Jordan, in an effort to improve gender equality and women’s opportunities to participate in the labour force.

**Methodology**

Drawing upon research conducted in Irbid, Salt and East Amman in 2017 and 2018, this paper will provide recommendations for the Jordanian transportation sector in creating and implementing inclusive policies using a gender perspective. The research includes focus group discussions and individual interviews with students, TVET managers, and representatives of local and governmental organizations. It also includes a recent participatory assessment of the transportation sector that focused specifically on the barriers faced by women, and an extensive review of secondary literature, including existing policies and governmental plans for the sector.


\(^9\) WE LEAD Transportation Assessment (2018)

\(^10\) WE LEAD Project Baseline Study (December 2017), Focus Group Discussions (FGDs) with ToExcel Consulting


\(^12\) WE LEAD Transportation Sector Assessment (2018)


\(^15\) Jordan’s executive development programmes (EDPs) 2018 -2020
The Impact of this Problem from a Gender Perspective

The current transportation demands of Jordanians mostly center around the desire to get to work or to an educational institution (Annex I). The Ministry of Transportation, regulatory commissions, private sector actors and other ministerial authorities and agencies (Annex II) acknowledge the vast influence that the transportation sector has on the economic performance of the country. Plans have been developed to implement new bus networks and services, enforce minimum standards for vehicles, upgrade facilities, and restructure the way in which services are operated and awarded to operators. However, none of the strategies, policies or plans for the sector have demonstrated any distinction between the needs of women and men, nor of any other specific group. Passengers tend to be homogeneously grouped and distinctive needs remain ignored. Investments dedicated to the entire Jordanian population are thus poured into a single segment of society. Taking into consideration identity factors, such as gender, would represent a significant step towards creating more efficient policies.

The main challenges to creating gender-sensitive public transportation policies include organizational issues such as bureaucracy, overlapping responsibilities and an overall lack of coordination within and between ministries and regulatory committees, and a scarcity of financial resources. The latter is particularly noticeable in the lack of expansion and maintenance of infrastructure. This is why the private sector is being encouraged by the government to invest in infrastructure and operating services. Hence, most passenger transportation is owned by private individuals and companies, including privately-owned smart applications such as Careem and Uber, as opposed to public services. Involving these private sector players in the implementation of inclusive policies may prove difficult, but is essential.

---

17 Jordan Long Term National Transport Strategy and Action Plan (2014), Ministry of Transportation with PTV Transport Consult GmbH and TRT Trasporti e Territorio srl., p. 64. “Without interventions, [...] the system will not perform as needed to support Jordanian economy and daily life of citizens”.
19 These include the Bus Rapid Transit Plan (2018-2023) and plans to implement state-owned bus companies and trams (2016-2019), as well as the Long Term National Transport Strategy and Action Plan (2014) and various secondary literature.
21 Executive Development Program (2016-2019), USAID, p. 272
24 WE LEAD Transportation Assessment (2018), Section 2.1. Page 12 and Section 3.2. Page 16
Reasons to Address the Problem:  
Key Barriers to Women’s Access to Transportation

The relative high costs, considerable safety concerns, unreliability and time consumption that are characteristic of the transportation sector in Jordan affect all segments of the population. Yet, these affect different segments of the population in unique ways. Certain barriers affect women in particular, thus placing them at a greater disadvantage when it comes to the use of transportation services. As the following sections will outline, women experience greater financial and safety concerns when it comes to the use of public and private transportation. What’s more, due to gendered social norms and the added vulnerability of unaccompanied women in the public sphere in Jordan, many families wish for their female family members to avoid using public transportation altogether.

A Higher Financial Burden

According to the Jordanian Department of Statistics (DoS), women earn, on average, 458 Jordanian Dinars a month when men make, on average, 507\(^{25}\). This does not take into consideration the fact that many women’s wages are lower than the value stated in contracts; a 2015 study led by Tamkeen Fields for Aid and a 2018 study by WE LEAD indicated that paying women less than their stated contracts was a common practice in the secretarial, beauty salon and supportive health services fields\(^{26}\). When looking at the labour market as a whole, women tend to make approximately 41% less than men in the private sector and 28% less in the public sector\(^{27}\). The result of this wage gap is that women then spend a disproportionately larger share of their salary on transportation than their male counterparts. This often impacts their ability to seek out employment or training options. Often, the decision to not seek out these services are made for them when the returns are less and the related transportation costs are too high.

Furthermore, many women are likely to be contributing to the income of a family unit. Thus, the decision to spend on transportation is not necessarily entirely dependent on her income alone. In cases where purchasing a private car for the family unit instead of of public transportation is possible, the priority of usage is usually attributed to a male family member as men are traditionally viewed as the primary breadwinners of their household\(^{28}\). Women’s salaries tend to be seen, by both men and women, as “extra” income that women can use on luxuries if the husband’s earnings alone are sufficient to support the household\(^{29}\). This relegates women to taking public transportation options or depending on the private cars of others to carpool to and from work.


\(^{27}\) Department of Statistics (DoS), Wage indices 2015, Department of Labor Statistics-Directorate of Economic Statistics, June 2017, Jordan.


\(^{29}\) WE LEAD Baseline study, December 2017, with ToExcel Consulting
Since many families prefer to invest in personal cars if they can afford it\textsuperscript{30}, private cars have become the preferred mode of transportation in Jordan. Yet, the Jordan Long Term National Transport Strategy and Action Plan recognizes that in many governorates only a minority of Jordanians actually possess their own car\textsuperscript{31}. These cars, concentrated in the capital, contribute significantly to a growing traffic problem that causes longer commutes, more dangerous road conditions, strains on infrastructure, limitations to participation in social life for some population groups, as well as severely negative impacts on the environment\textsuperscript{32}. Increasing the number of private cars is thus not considered a long-term solution to transportation issues. In its National Transport Strategy and Action Plan, the Ministry of Transportation concedes that alternative options, namely public transportation services and technological solutions such as smart applications, require much improvement if they are to present a viable alternative\textsuperscript{33}.

In fact, of the 100 women interviewed in East Amman, Irbid and Salt, for WE LEAD’s transportation study, 52\% of them said they still rely on relatives or friends to drive them to work\textsuperscript{34}. Another 36\% use ‘service taxis’ - that is, taxis that have a fixed route and pick up several passengers on the way - and 11\% use private taxis\textsuperscript{35}. Yet taking taxis also tends to be a costly endeavour. A commute in a private taxi can cost about 2 dinars for a distance of approximately 5 kilometres. Such return trips on a daily basis can amount to 80 Jordanian dinars a month. In fact, 81\% of the aforementioned women commuters who were interviewed in East Amman, Irbid and Salt stated that they spend up to 30\% of their salaries on transportation\textsuperscript{36}.

The result of these financial challenges is that women have less access to affordable transportation options resulting in their greater exclusion from economic opportunities. The following two sections will highlight, why in the face of such expensive private options, women do not use less costly forms of transportation, such as public or private buses, or simply walking.

**Greater Safety Concerns**

For women in particular, the weaknesses in the current public transportation system can present significant risks to personal safety. The unreliable bus schedules, inappropriate transportation routes and general lack of proper safety mechanisms place passengers in risky positions wherein women can be especially vulnerable to attacks and harassment while taking public transportation or on the way to or from a pick-up location. In focus group discussions held for WE LEAD in 2018 in East Amman, Irbid and Salt, 83\% of women stated they do not rely on public transportation for their daily trips\textsuperscript{37}.

\textsuperscript{30} WE LEAD Transportation Sector Assessment (2018) Most female respondents state that they use public transportation because they cannot afford a car. That is, their salaries do not permit the purchase or renting of a car.

\textsuperscript{31} Jordan Long Term National Transport Strategy and Action Plan (2014), Ministry of Transportation with PTV Transport Consult GmbH and TRT Trasporti e Territorio srl., p.34

\textsuperscript{32} Ibid. Page 34.

\textsuperscript{33} Ibid. Page 35.

\textsuperscript{34} WE LEAD Transportation Sector Assessment (2018)

\textsuperscript{35} Ibid.

\textsuperscript{36} Ibid.

\textsuperscript{37} WE LEAD Transportation Sector Assessment (2018).
Unreliable schedules often translate into longer waiting times for passengers at bus stops or on the side of the road. It also translates into passengers having to commute before sunrise and/or after sunset. Inappropriate transportation routes and pick-up or drop-off locations are an additional factor that limit women’s use of public transportation. On average, public transportation users walk 500m to 1km of rough roads to get to the nearest pick-up point. This is especially true in rural areas where the wait times and commutes are longer and the routes even more isolated. Carrying or walking with young children is an added challenge for women reaching those points, and puts them and their children at further risk, especially given the presence of dogs protecting their herds in rural areas, the lack of sidewalks and and sexual harassment, especially in isolated areas. Indeed, 80% of women interviewed in WE LEAD’s 2018 transportation assessment highlighted that their use of public transportation would increase should they have access to an information desk, departure and arrival times, route maps, and comfortable seats.

One of the few studies conducted on sexual harassment in public areas in Jordan found, for example, that over half of Jordanian women were subjected to some form of sexual harassment in 2014. In WE LEAD’s transportation assessment many women stated they felt uncomfortable and scared for their safety given inappropriate behaviours that are a regular occurrence in buses. These behaviours were described as men looking at women in the mirror in an inappropriate way, using inappropriate language to flirt with women, or offering their phone numbers to try to get acquainted with women. Bus drivers playing songs with inappropriate lyrics is also a common complaint from women who take the bus. The lack of safety was cited as the reason why these women left their jobs or found other employment options closer to home that would allow them to avoid public transportation and avoid harassment. In a focus group discussion in East Amman in 2017, many male participants agreed that public transportation further exposes women to sexual harassment. Similar to public transportation concerns, many women cited feeling vulnerable when calling for taxis on the side of the street, not only because of sexual harassment from passersby, but also from taxi drivers themselves.

Notably, the safety indicators in the Ministry of Transportation’s National Strategy and Action Plan solely include injuries and fatalities; they do not refer to harassment or theft. However, many Jordanians recognize sexual harassment as an issue. Thus, conducting a further analysis of the different safety concerns women and men face on transport is crucial for developing an inclusive and responsive transportation system in Jordan.

---

38 Ibid.
39 Ibid.
40 Ibid.
41 Ibid.
43 WE LEAD Transportation Sector Assessment (2018).
44 Ibid.
45 Ibid.
46 WE LEAD Baseline Study (2017), with ToExcel Consulting.
47 Ibid.
48 Jordan Long Term National Transport Strategy and Action Plan (2014), Ministry of Transportation with PTV Transport Consult GmbH and TRT Trasporti e Territorio srl., p.3
Restrictive Social Expectations and Gender Norms

In Jordan, restrictions to women’s access and control over different social and economic aspects of their lives may be highly influenced by family, associated with community customs and traditions. This is especially the case when families feel there is a risk to their daughters or wives during the journey to work, for instance because of using unsafe transportation options, and especially for women who have children who need to be delivered to schools or daycares, making their commutes all the more complicated. Many are obliged to use taxis or travel with a friend or relative for more safety.

Reasons influencing family members restricting women’s participation in certain professions include fear for the women’s safety from harm at the workplace, and fear for the woman from society’s perceptions. Women’s families see that riding in taxis and buses is considered inappropriate for women, specifically due to the absence of adequate public cultural awareness and drivers, owners and users not respecting the regulations of public transportation, which results in non-compliance with the laws, regulations, and instructions necessary to provide good and efficient services. The high likelihood of unacceptable behaviours as mentioned above can be particularly damaging from a social point of view for Jordanian women in particular.

A woman’s choice of relying on transportation to get to work or to an educational institution often relies on the capability of her family unit as a whole to absorb the costs. Traditional norms dictate that men are the main breadwinners of the household and women are the main caretakers of the home. Therefore, a woman deciding to leave the family unit for the day must take into consideration the costs of daycare and the costs of finding transportation that is adequate. She must also find transportation that enables her to return home in time for her household responsibilities.

Finally, sexual harassment is still a largely taboo subject within Jordan. Women who are exposed to sexual harassment in any space, including transportation and the workplace, often prefer to stop taking public transportation or leave their place of work rather than report it or continue to experience possible victimization and the social stigma of being harassed. The high likelihood of unacceptable behaviours on transportation can be particularly damaging from a social point of view for Jordanian women as they are often held responsible rather than the individuals harassing them. Ultimately, when families feel there is a risk to their daughters or wives during the journey to work, women are often pressured to use taxis or travel with a friend or relative for more safety, thus limiting a woman’s mobility.

---

Recommendations

Since women in general, whether married or unmarried, with or without children, cannot rely on public transportation to go to work or their studies, or to send their children to schools, nurseries or kindergartens, they cannot reliably plan their daily trips due to the various challenges they face with the transportation system in Jordan. This policy paper has focused on the three main aspects of cost, safety, and norms. In order to address obstacles and difficulties of transportation for women, and to provide them with safer and easier transportation options, and ensure that transportation is equally important to men and women, this paper makes the following recommendations:

Addressing Broader Strategic Issues:

- Mainstream gender equality through any future transportation strategy and its operationalization at all levels to ensure the needs of women are incorporated into any new strategy or project.

- Make Gender Equality a Policy Pillar within all future transportation strategies.

- Encourage more research on gender-related issues such as street harassment, female labour participation, and women’s mobility, freedom of decision-making and control over resources. Consider using the data collected in creating more inclusive policies and transportation plans.

- Consult local communities in villages and far-off areas, taking into consideration women and men’s opinions regarding transportation obstacles and giving them the chance to suggest realistic solutions based on their day-to-day experiences. Advocate their suggestions at the national level in order to meet the needs of these communities.

Addressing the Higher Financial Burden:

- Adopt a specific bus rental strategy as part of the general transportation strategy to transport women from gathering areas close to their places of residence to training centers, workplaces or schools as the monthly cost when distributed on the passengers will be less, thus decrease the financial burden on them in addition to reducing the risk that they may face when they are alone walking to the bus station or with their children.

- Work on exchanging experiences with other international regions. Research how they link transport and gender in the same strategy and examine the value of travel time savings from a gender perspective, as the travel time is one of the largest costs of transportation.

- Coordinate with existing taxi service applications such as Careem and Uber to launch a special promo code that gives women certain discounts on the ride, thus providing a more affordable means to transportation. Consider encouraging these services to operate smoothly with taxi services and upgrade their carpooling options.
**Addressing the Greater Safety Concerns:**

Create safety standards that include trainings for bus/taxi drivers and collectors on preventing and addressing cases of discrimination and sexual harassment in their vehicles. Consider these trainings as criteria for licensing and that permits be removed should the safety standards not be respected.

Adapt bus station maps and routes to focus on safety and social inclusion.

Widely disseminate information on public transportation, including routes and schedules to the general public. Consider easily accessible information desks, television ads, social media campaigns, or maps and schedules at bus stops.

Create a scorecard model between the transportation agencies as a systematic way to improve their coordination and to make their vision and strategies concrete and measurable. This will help in building an analysis of women and men's utilization of the transport system and thus, improve the system's development and management. It should include gender-disaggregated data on travel patterns, time spent on travel, modes of transportation, travel costs, accessibility to accurate travel information, etc.

**Addressing the Restrictive Social Expectations and Gender Norms:**

Regularly document passengers’ experiences, especially those of women and members of other vulnerable groups such as elderly persons and persons with disabilities. Ensure that all data is gender-disaggregated and impacts are measured according to the various realities of a diversified demographic.

Establish a Community Coordination Committee that analyzes the data and lessons learned by consulting community members, especially women who use public or private transportation, and encouraging a participatory approach. This would align with the National Long-Term Transportation Strategy and Action Plan’s goal to promote “greater inclusion and participation of citizens in the decision-making process, where information-sharing and dialogue is encouraged”.

Develop a strategic quarterly work plan with gender organizations and experts to conduct monthly awareness sessions with community members about ‘Security Awareness’ when using private and public transportation. Include subjects such as harassment, road safety and proper conduct. Adapt these awareness sessions to various demographics and use various social media and radio messaging. For instance, they should teach men and boys not to harass and what to do in case they witness such a situation, and teach women and girls what safety mechanisms are available to them.

Conduct raising awareness sessions for all transportation key players, policy makers and the community about the “Sexual Harassment” new definition, based on Law No 27/2017 that amended the original penal No. 16/1960.
Conclusion

During a meeting with the Ministry of Transportation in 2017, King Abdullah II strongly stated that “it cannot be accepted that people suffer to reach their workplaces or homes because of the absence of a public transport system which respects their humanity and meets their needs”. This paper had the objective of highlighting ways in which transportation policies and plans in Jordan can be made more inclusive to respond to the particular needs of women given their significant disadvantages when it comes to the use of public and private transportation.

Whereas one of the Policy Pillars of the National Long-Term Transportation Strategy and Action Plan of 2014 is “Safety and Social Inclusion”, it targets all Jordanians as a homogenous group without taking into account differing gender needs in their strategic goals. Strategies, plans and their operationalization still require gender analyses that will feed into proper gender mainstreaming throughout the sector. A gender perspective and attention to gender equality are yet to be presented in decision-making, implementation and sector monitoring.

The paper focused on three key barriers that disproportionately affect women, namely costs, safety concerns and restrictive social expectations and gender norms. These barriers remain unaddressed by current transportation systems and plans that ignore gender needs and gaps that lead to unequal access to transportation services. The transportation sector’s inability to provide women with quality services is preventing fuller returns on investment and even impacting the country’s economy by negatively affecting women’s labour market participation. The recommendations listed in this paper aim to improve women’s mobility in Jordan. Their integration into strategies and plans is bound to translate into more efficient and inclusive transportation systems for all, men and women.
Annexes:

I. Purpose of Jordanian Individuals’ Use of Transportation (Country-Wide)
Non Gender-Disaggregated Data Collected by the Jordanian Ministry of Transportation
Annexes:

II. Key Players in Jordan’s Transportation Sector