A Global Learning Network

Markets that provide opportunities for all people to engage and prosper.

seepnetwork.org/Members
Chicken or Egg? Prioritizing Direct Interventions vs. Changing Social Norms

June 28, 2017 | 9:30 am – 10:30 am EDT

Erin Markel, MarketShare Associates
Prerna Kumar, ICRW
Fatimah Kelleher, Independent Consultant
Raj Gilda, Lend A Hand India
Namaya Lewanika, Private Enterprise Program Zambia
Prerna Kumar
ICRW
pkumar@icrw.org
SECONDARY EDUCATION-India

- **RASHTRIYA MADHYAMIK SHIKSHA ABHIYAN (RMSA)**
  - to enhance access to secondary education and improve its quality
  - to enhance the enrollment at secondary stage
  - aim to ensure Gross Enrollment Ratio of 100% by 2017 and universal retention by 2020.

The other objectives include removing gender, socio-economic and disability barriers, etc.

**VOCATIONALISATION OF SECONDARY AND HIGHER SECONDARY EDUCATION**

- to enhance employability
- to maintain their competitiveness
- to reduce the dropout rate at the secondary level
Government of India’s ‘National Policy for Women 2016 – Articulating a Vision for Empowerment of Women’

• As part of Secondary School Education Curriculum for girls and women, promote
  - Skill development
  - Vocational Training
  - Life Skills Training

• Supportive environment through responsive mechanism to address discriminatory attitudes

• Gender sensitization of faculty, curriculum, content and pedagogies to address gender stereotypes
Scoping Study—Adolescent Girls

• To understand the state of the field of adolescent programming in India

• To inform the design of future comprehensive programs that address both the productive and reproductive dimensions of girls’ lives.
Learning

Integrated Programs

Girl at the center

Ecological Approach
THEORY OF CHANGE

P.A.C.E Bronze

GOAL
Tested and scaled program for equipping vulnerable adolescent girls for their future as empowered, economically active and equal members of their communities
Plan-It Girls

• Building empowerment and gender equality at the local level
• Leveraging a catalytic personal advancement curriculum tailored for girls attending upper secondary school in concert with multi-level interventions working with principals and teachers, business leaders, parents, boys and young men to create an environment that supports girls and their aspirations.
• Test an institution-based development model that, if proven successful, will ensure girls enrolled in public school gain the skills, competencies and connections they need to have choices after graduation.
• Coaching girls to find their voice and exercise agency, by focusing on building the skills and competencies.

• Creating pathways to employment by twinning public schools with local industry
• Plan-It Girls will help create a pool of employment-ready young women who are able to realistically aspire for a better life and plan for their own future
• Focus on girls but address the environment simultaneously
• Programming with a strong gender lens
• Expanding the scope of livelihoods beyond skill-building activities to include job placement and/or support to enable girls to become self-employed.
• Follow the principle of ‘DO NO HARM’ – minimize risk of conflict and backlash from community
• Sustaining the dividends of adolescent girls programing
• Outcomes of the program need to be defined in measurable terms
• Pathways for program outcomes and the inter-relationship between variables need to be clearly defined
Social norms, markets programming, and women’s economic empowerment

Fatinmeh Kelleher
Independent Consultant and Senior Associate at WISE Development International
fatimah@wisedevelopment.com
Drawing lessons from market system and market linkage engagement

• Experiences drawn from WISE Development International working across multiple market systems programmes in Nigeria, Ghana and Uganda

• Additional experiences drawn from market linkage programming with rural women in Pakistan and Guyana
The market systems approach (also known as M4P):

❖ Direct linkages between “the poor” and the market are facilitated to alleviate programmatic issues identified (e.g. poor income / low sales)

❖ Wide range of actors engaged, but actual investment more directly made in private sector partners in order to strengthen market access / unblock barriers within the system

❖ Investment in social development partners often extremely difficult, often seen as being outside of “pure” market development
Social norm change and market programming

• Social norm change rarely considered as a necessary pre-requisite or integral part of engagement – the “market will organically fix all”

But:

• social norms – especially when manifested as gendered economic norms – are integral part of barriers to the market women face
M4P framework

Do women have access to the services and information they need?

How does infrastructure support women’s economic activity? E.g. Time saving

Are social norms discriminating against women and limiting women’s rights?

Are women able to meet and organise?

How are laws and standards supporting women’s access to assets?

Roles of women

MARKET PLAYERS
Delivering and resourcing different functions

Government

INFRASTRUCTURE
Information

Private sector

SUPPORTING FUNCTIONS

Related services

Demand
Supply

CORE

Not-for-profit sector

REGULATIONS
Standards
Laws

Informal rules & norms

Membership organisations

Informal networks
The relationship between gendered economic norms and the market

Northern Nigeria example: Social norms as *gendered economic norms* in need of change

- Despite high productivity, women’s direct engagement with modern markets hampered by multiple factors, including:
  - Norms around mobility and the practice of seclusion (*purdah* or *kulli*)
  - Norms attached to land inheritance that differentiate access to and need of services
  - Norms around productive roles and usage/sale of outputs

- Social norm change, especially when manifested as gendered economic norms, is imperative to *genuine transformational change*

- Arguing *either/or* presents something of a false dichotomy. The market system is itself a product of those – and many other – norms.
Tackling social norms through the lens of gendered economic norm change

• Pilot Case Study: Empowering women rice par boilers in northern Nigeria:
  ❖ Women rice par boilers with some access to the market but hampered by gendered economic norms surrounding relationships with male buyers
  ❖ Investment made by the programme in women’s agency, leadership and collective organising, as well as a focus on the quality of their rice production
  ❖ Resulted in:
    ▪ Increased sales
    ▪ Strengthened role of women within the market trading system
    ▪ New dynamic between women par boilers and male traders – shift in gendered expectations
    ▪ Greater individual and collective agency amongst producers

• Similar experiences of market linkage programming in Pakistan and Guyana
What needs to change in the way we programme market approaches

• Market programming needs to move away from “purist” private sector investment-only positioning if WEE is a desired outcome

• Understanding social norms and gendered economic norms in particular at the contextual level needs investment – continued dearth in granular economic research for WEE

• Engagement of and partnership with women’s groups and organisations (at the local level esp.) to be fostered

• Women’s collective organising and action for economic empowerment an integral force within transformed market dynamics

• Considerations around going to scale – when, where, and how - needs to be better considered.
Lend A Hand India
Working at the intersection of education and livelihood

Raj Gilda
Lend A Hand India
raj.gilda@lend-a-hand-india.org
Lend-A-Hand India’s goal is to make secondary education in India relevant to employment and entrepreneurship.

Gaps in the education system

- 62% of students drop out of school by the 10th grade.
- The education system focuses on rote learning and does not equip them with necessary practical skills to earn their livelihood – through employment or entrepreneurship.
- Only 7% of Indian youth have any exposure to vocational education.
- All skill training efforts (government or private ITI’s) are targeted towards post 10th grade students.
Project Swadheen (Self Reliant): Gender Neutral Multi Skill Vocational Education As Part of Secondary School

Four Sections

1. **Basic Engineering**
   - Welding, Carpentry, Plumbing, Fabrication

2. **Energy and Environment**
   - Electrical wiring, renewable energy

3. **Agriculture and Animal Husbandry / Gardening Landscaping** *
   - Seed processing, fertilizers, food processing, Animal feed

4. **Health and Hygiene**
   - Nutrition, Blood Group testing, blood pressure measurement

*For Urban Schools – substitute Agriculture with landscaping, gardening etc.
Operating Model

Premises
Secondary Schools

Training Module
- Basic Engineering
- Energy and Environment
- Agriculture and Animal Husbandry
- Health and Hygiene

Instructors
Local trade practitioners, recruited and trained to teach students, 1 day a week for 3 years

Beneficiaries
Secondary school students (9th–10th Grade)

4.5 hrs/week within the school time table
Operating Principles

Focus on high school students
Only program to focus on high school students age 14-17

Local Community Partnerships
Program conducted with active participation from the local community—trade practitioners recruited as trainers

Use of existing infrastructure
Using government aided high schools as delivery centers hence not adding any fixed cost and new infrastructure

Working within the system
Government as an active partner (conducts and certifies the exam), encourages schools to participate

Multi Skill
Long term course with multi-skill training to change the basic mind set of students which develops the scientific temper and the capability to act.

Gender Neutral
Same skills taught to both boys and girls—leading to gender empowerment as girls learn the skills which are normally male dominated (electrical wiring, plumbing, carpentry etc)

Highly Scalable Program in a Cost Effective Way
The Multi Skill Foundation Course (MSFC) has demonstrated significant impact on employment, entrepreneurship and education indicators.

Multi Skill students are 3 times more likely to be employed, self-employed and to pursue technical degrees.

**Girl Students Specific Impact Indicators:**
1. **Continued Higher Education:** More than two times (62% vs. 27%)
2. **Fee Payment:** At an average 66% of girls have paid fees vs. 58% for boys
3. **Type of Higher Education Pursued:** 29% of them pursuing professional courses (ITI, Diploma, BSc etc)

**Multi Skill Vocational Education breaks the social stigma against vocational training** – 61% of parents of MSFC students pay fees for the course

**Entrepreneurial abilities of students begin at school** – each school earns on average INR 10,000/year through student undertaken projects.

Source: Sir Dorabji Tata Trust funded impact assessment on Multi Skill Foundation Course
The Multi Skill Foundation Course (MSFC) has demonstrated significant impact on employment, entrepreneurship and education indicators

Additional Impact Indicators:

• Reduction in gender stereotyping was seen when 147 parents (99% of the total 148 surveyed) shared that they had seen / experienced changes pertaining to gender stereotyping and roles amongst their children.

• 135 parents (91% of the total 148 surveyed) shared that they have seen their boys participate more in domestic / household tasks on a regular basis.

• 91% of the students responded that they are able to work with the opposite sex easily.

• 92% being able to talk freely and 100% facing no difficulty in dealing with each other (boys and girls).
Steps taken for Scale-up of Multi Skill Foundation Course

1. Recognized as one of the core subject (optional) for Grade 9\textsuperscript{th} and 10\textsuperscript{th}

2. Joint assessment/certification by the industry recognized sector skill councils and the State Board

3. Conducted two independent Impact Assessment supported by (1) Tata Trusts (2) Axis Bank Foundation

4. Curriculum recognized as \textbf{National Skills Qualification Framework} Compliant (Level 1 and 2)

5. Vertical integration for 11\textsuperscript{th} and 12\textsuperscript{th} Grade launched in 2016-17
Current Size and Outreach of “Project Swadheen”

10 States...
101 staff members...
1200+ Schools...
90,000+ students...
Key Lessons Learned

1. Plan for pilots at regional levels as education is central as well as state subject

2. Establishing role models/case studies early on essential for further propagation of the program, especially for girls opting for non-traditional careers

3. Need to ensure ways for continuity of the work given the frequent transfers of the government officials

4. Establishing alumi tracking system early on
Namaya Lewanik

Private Enterprise Program Zambia (PEPZ)

namaya@pepzambia.com
Overview – PEPZ Entry Points

Private Enterprise Programme Zambia
- DFID funded £15 million programme implemented by Nathan Associates, in collaboration with DAI
- Comprised of 4 components (Business Linkages Component, Business Development Services, Business Plan Competition (BPC) and Accelerator fund)
- Focused largely of quadrants 1 and 2 of change matrix
- The BPC – Nyamuka Zambia – primarily focused on changing attitudes to entrepreneurship & women as entrepreneurs/ business owners (Quadrants 2 and 4)
Why? What are the challenges?

• Implementing any intervention requires understanding of social norms as they always have an influence
• Examples of individual and society wide social norm challenges for women in business in Zambia:
  • Confidence levels, negotiation skills, networking skills
  • Work life balance
  • Women often limited stereotypical gender roles e.g. caretaker, mother, house chores
  • Lower levels of education because male education is viewed as more important
  • Women owned businesses are largely informal with limited opportunities for growth
PEPZ solutions

• **Direct interventions**: Support to SMEs through technical, linkages, training, mentoring

• **Interventions to change individual perceptions**: eg Panels at business conferences. Not exclusive of one gender.

• **Society wide influencing campaign**: Nyamuka marketing & communications strategy to change society’s attitudes to entrepreneurship and also women in business. E.g. Women mean business video (https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=aHI Zy9gEXY), women networking organisations
Effectiveness of Nyamuka Zambia

- **Internal M&E of process:**
  - Numbers of women applying increased from 24% in 2015 to 30% in 2017
  - Number of women reaching semi-finalist stage increased from 20% in 2015 to 35% in 2017

- **Prize winners:**
  - Female prize winners increased from 25% in 2015 to 30% in 2016

- **Wider attitudinal survey:**
  - Positive attitudes to entrepreneurship disaggregated by gender:
    - Number of women that thought business was a good career option increased from 69% in 2015 to 87% in 2017
  - Tracks women (and men) responders income brackets: The income bracket of earnings of ZMW 15,000 and above shows the number for female entrepreneurs almost doubling from 33.3% in 2016 to 60% in 2017.
Erin Markel, MarketShare Associates
Prerna Kumar, ICRW
Fatimah Kelleher, Independent Consultant
Raj Gilda, Lend A Hand India
Namaya Lewanika, Private Enterprise Program Zambia
Thank you!

For more information about SEEP’s Women’s Economic Empowerment Working Group, contact the facilitators:

**Erin Markel**
<erin@marketshareassociates.com>

**Prerna Kumar,**
**ICRW**
pkumar@icrw.org

**Fatimah Kelleher**
**Independent Consultant**
fatimah@wisedevelopment.com

**Raj Gilda**
**Lend A Hand India**
raj.gilda@lend-a-hand-india.org

**Namaya Lewanika**
**Private Enterprise Program Zambia**
namaya@pepzambia.com

---

**Lis Meyers**
<lmeyers@banyanglobal.com>

www.seepnetwork.org
A Review of 2017 WEE Global Learning Forum is now available!

https://weeforum2017.org/

Stay tuned for video interviews with participants, plenary recordings, and more!